

In regards to evidences of unacceptability of the planned project “Renovation of the industrial compound into a wood processing factory” (file #20188144297), in response to the letter from Rivne oblast department of environment #266/04/1,2-01/20 from 27.01.2020 (Annex 1)

Civil society organization Ecoclub supports the willingness for an economic development of Rivne oblast and Ukraine as whole. However, operations of the factories, which emissions and discharges harm people and environment, is unacceptable under any circumstances.

There is a possibility of a positive conclusion for the renovation of the industrial compound into a wood processing factory in Rivne oblast, Horodok village, Barona Shteinghelia str. 4a (hereinafter – the planned operations). If the conclusion is issued, inhabitants of the neighboring villages will suffer from the pollution and the environment will be damaged. This is a clear violation of the articles 15, 50 and 66 of the Constitutions of Ukraine. The fact has been concluded by NGO Ecoclub and the associate professor of land management department of National University of Environmental Engineering, PhD in technical sciences Vasyl’ Korbutiak after analyzing the data presented in the Report on EIA of the planned operations and relevant regulations on emissions and discharges of harmful chemicals by the planned factory.

In this letter only the data, extracted from the Report on EIA of the planned operations, prepared by LLC “Technopryvis Invest Group” and named “Renovation of the industrial compound into a wood processing factory at Barona Sheinghelia 4a str., Horodok Village, Rivne rayon, Rivne oblast”, file #20188144297 (hereinafter – Report on EIA). No other assumptions were made and no data from other sources was used for the preparation of this document.

The Report on EIA and additional materials on the impact on health of citizens assessment estimates the one-time emission limit concentrations (ELCo.t.) instead of the defined annually average concentrations of pollutants. Wherein the Report on EIA does not refer to any legal acts justifying such a method. We would like to note that the ELCo.t. is such a concentration that does not lead to reflex responses of human organism after breathing for 20 minutes. Average daily emission limit concentration – is a concentration of a pollutant in the air of settlements which causes no direct or indirect effects on human health for an indefinite breathing.

The incomplete list of law violations identified in the Report on EIA:

1. The report on EIA for the planned operations does not take into account an existent pollution of Horodok village, which is already many times higher than the norm. According to the Decree#1139 from 29.12.2012 issued by Ministry for environmental protection of Ukraine “On adoption of public health regulations and regulations on “Polymers and polymer-containing materials, products and frameworks used in construction and furniture production. Hygienic requirements.” the limit concentration of pollutants in ambient air of settlements is such a concentration that for the human lifetime causes no harm to health of citizens and future generations, does not reduce working capacity and well-being.

The Report on EIA uses the term “Reference (safe) concentration of pollutants (RfCi), mg/m³” in table 5.4.1.3, derived from “Methodology guidelines MR 2.2.12.142-2007 “Assessment of health risks for citizens caused by an ambient air pollution” adopted by Decree of Ministry of Health of Ukraine from 13.04.07 #184.

The table below provides limit concentrations, reference (safe) concentrations and background concentrations of some pollutants from the Report on EIA and the letter of Rivne oblast center on hydrometeorology (Annexed to the Report on EIA, page 247).

Pollutant	Limit concentration, Decree #1139 mg/m ³	Reference (safe) concentrations of pollutants (RfCi) according to MR 2.2.12-142-2007 , mg/m ³	Background concentration mg/m ³
Nitrogen dioxide		0,04	0,018
Carbon monoxide		5	0,4
Formaldehyde	0,003	0,003	0,014
Sulfur dioxide		0,08	0,02
Manganese and its compounds		0,00005	0,004
Phenol	0,003	0,006	0,004
Toluene	0,6	0,4	0,24
Benzene	0,1	0,06	0,6

The table means that substances that the planned factory will emit already pollute the ambient air in Horodok village. Thus, the background concentration of formaldehyde exceeds safe concentration by 4,6 times and of benzene – by 10 times. Benzene is a strong cancerogen. Studies link benzene to diseases such as aplastic anemia, acute leukemia, myelodysplastic syndrome and marrow diseases. The U.S. Department of Health and Human Services and International Agency for Research of Cancer (IARC) classify formaldehyde as a cancerogen for humans, basing on studies of inhalation effects on humans and laboratory animals.

Thus, given the information of Rivne oblast center on hydrometeorology, citizens of Horodok already suffer from an air pollution.

2. The Report on EIA clearly indicates the planned violation of the requirements of Decree #309 of Ministry of environmental protection of Ukraine from 27.06.2006. “On adoption of emission limit values for pollutants from fixed sources”.

The extract from **Table 1.5.2.4** compares established limits with projected emissions of pollutants into an ambient air:

ID of emission source	ID of the pollutant	Name of the pollutant	Actual emission	Emission limit value

			Content by weight in gas-dust flow mg/m ³	Volume of the mass flow in emitted gases kg/hour	Content by weight in gas-dust flow mg/m ³	Volume of the mass flow in emitted gases kg/hour
16	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	10,4	4,995000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
22	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	3,7	0,185000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
23	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	1,3	0,185000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
24	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	1,6	0,185000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
28	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	11,7	0,111000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
29	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	11,7	0,111000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
30	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	11,7	0,111000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
31	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	11,7	0,111000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour
32	11049/1325	Formaldehyde	11,7	0,111000	20	up to 0,1 kg/hour

It is evident from the table, that the emissions of formaldehyde from source #16 will exceed the limit value by 50 times. It means that the emission of formaldehyde in the ambient air will exceed the volume that could dissolve safely in the atmosphere in many times.

3. The table 5.4.1.3. “Assessment of risks of non-cancerogenic effects” from the Report on EIA directly mentions excessive concentrations of pollutants comparing to safe levels:

Nitrogen dioxide – by 2,98 times

Formaldehyde – by 5,62 times

Suspended particles – by 2,67 times

Therefore, authors of the Report on EIA univocally confirm that planned emissions are harmful for human health and environment.

4. According to the table 1.5.2.7 - “Planned amount of waste during the operations” the next types and volumes of waste will be produced:

ID under the State Registry 005-96	Name under the State Registry 005-96	Class	Volume, tons/year
------------------------------------	--------------------------------------	-------	-------------------

2000.1.2.15	Expired, contaminated or non-identified glues and their residues that can not be utilized.	2	1160
6000.2.8.10	Expired or spent oils, engine and transmission oils.	2	16

Page 169 of the Report on EIA points out that “Wastes are collected into urns and disposed into a garbage container, situated on the factory’s area. Afterwards they are transported by a public utility to an operational landfill, according to a contract”.

Under item 1.4 of Rules of operation of landfills (Decree #435 of Ministry of housing of Ukraine from 01.12.2010), “Landfills may be allowed to accept residential waste (apart from liquid residential waste and hazardous waste together with residential waste) from residential buildings, administrative and public facilities and organizations, trade and public catering companies, cultural and art institutions, educational and healthcare facilities and other companies, institutions and organizations regardless their ownership; they also accept sweepings from streets, gardens and parks, leaves, crushed construction waste and industrial waste of III and IV class of hazard according to sanitary rules and norms; they accept slag and ashes from incinerating plants.”

Therefore, the Report on EIA validates the intention to place hazardous waste at the existent landfill, which is a violation of Rules for operation and can possess threats to residents if the waste or its decay products contaminate surface or ground waters or an ambient air.

5. The report on EIA violates para 2 of Article 5 and para 2 of section 2 of Article 6 of the Law of Ukraine “On environmental impact assessment” as it does not include the technological alternatives of the manufacturing processes (only one of treatment units is considered) and territorial alternatives for the project.

Taking into account all the above mentioned, “Technopryvid Invest Group” LLC deliberately plans to breach a range of legal norms. **If any type of permit for the planned operations is issued, it will lead to hazardous effects on lives and health of residents of neighboring settlements and continuous pollution of the environment.**

Considering the abovementioned, we ask XXXX to:

1. Issue the conclusion of the EIA procedure that forbids planned operations and urge “Technopryvid Invest Group” LLC to develop a new project of renovation of the industrial compound into a wood processing factory, which poses no threat to health and environment.
2. In view of discovered severe pollution of an ambient air in Horodok village of Rivne rayon of Rivne oblast and within its powers, endorse and/or adopt the decision on location of a fixed monitoring station in Horodok village. The station should allow measuring of concentrations of the above mentioned substances, including benzene and formaldehyde.
3. Considering the identified gaps in the legal regulations of an environmental protection and protection of an ambient air in particular to endorse and/or adopt a decision within its powers on:
 - a. Restoration of currently inactive requirements for an ambient air protection, contained in Public health regulation on protection of an ambient air in settlements (from pollution by chemical and biological substances).
 - b. Restoration of currently inactive requirements for management of hazardous waste contained in Public health norms and rules 2.2.2.029-99 “Hygienic requirements on management of industrial waste and its hazard class definition for public health”.
 - c. Develop and adopt a legal act that precludes from provision of a positive conclusion for the Reports on EIA that contain information on planned violation of the law.

We kindly ask to inform NGO Ecoclub about the consideration of the appeal and taken measures according to the Law of Ukraine On communications from citizens to the e-mail: office@ecoclubrivne.org or regular mail sent to NGO “Ecoclub”, Stepana Bandery 41 st., office 92, Rivne, 33014.

Chair of the board of NGO Ecoclub

Martynyuk A.M.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, consisting of several loops and a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.



УКРАЇНА
РІВНЕНСЬКА ОБЛАСНА ДЕРЖАВНА АДМІНІСТРАЦІЯ
ДЕПАРТАМЕНТ ЕКОЛОГІЇ ТА ПРИРОДНИХ РЕСУРСІВ
вул. Толстого, 20, м. Рівне, 33028, тел./факс (0362) 62-03-64, тел. (0362) 26-47-23,
E-mail: info@ecorivne.gov.ua Код ЄДРПОУ 38756267

На № вих. 17 від 24.01.2020 № 286/04/д-01/20 від 15.01.2020

Громадська організація „Екоклуб”

33001, вул. Петра Могили, 28, офіс 35,
м. Рівне, Рівненська область

Департамент екології та природних ресурсів Рівненської обласної державної адміністрації 15 січня 2020 року отримав Ваші зауваження до Звіту з оцінки впливу на довкілля планованої діяльності Товариства з обмеженою відповідальністю „Технопривід Інвест Груп” щодо реконструкції промислового комплексу будівель і споруд під підприємство деревообробної промисловості в с. Городок Рівненського району Рівненської області (реєстраційний номер справи – 20198144297).

Відповідно до Закону України „Про оцінку впливу на довкілля”, департамент екології та природних ресурсів Рівненської обласної державної адміністрації проводить аналіз отриманих зауважень та пропозицій, що надійшли під час громадського обговорення планованої діяльності.

З метою об’єктивного аналізу та врахування отриманих письмових зауважень, просимо надати вихідну інформацію, яка була використана для проведення розрахунку, розрахунок викидів забруднюючих речовин в атмосферному повітрі з посиланням на використані методики; розрахунок приземних концентрацій з посиланням на використані програмні засоби; дані фонового забруднення атмосфери в районі розміщення об’єкта планової діяльності результати яких представлені у листі.

Директор департаменту

Володимир ЗАХАРЧУК